

SUDBURY SELECT BOARD

TUESDAY FEBRUARY 27, 2024

7:00 PM – HYBRID MEETING

(Meeting can be viewed at www.sudburytv.org)

SUDBURY POLICE STATION TRAINING ROOM, 75 HUDSON ROAD, SUDBURY MA

Present: Chair Janie Dretler, Vice-Chair Lisa Kouchakdjian, Select Board Member Daniel Carty, Select Board Member Jennifer Roberts, Select Board Member Charles Russo, Town Manager Andrew Sheehan

The statutory requirements as to notice having been compiled with, the meeting was convened at 7:00 PM, via Zoom telecommunication mode.

Chair Dretler announced the recording of the meeting and other procedural aspects included in the meeting.

Call to Order

Select Board Roll Call: Kouchakdjian-present, Carty-present, Russo-present, Roberts-present, Dretler-present

Opening remarks by Chair

- Condolences to the Shahani family who lost a family member to home fire on Goodman's Hill Road; thanked all safety officials from Sudbury and surrounding communities for their selfless efforts
- Sudbury Health Department sponsoring Household Hazardous Waste Collection Day on Saturday, March 30, 2024 from 8:00 AM to 12:00 PM at Sudbury DPW building; it's a free event, however, pre-registration recommended and Sudbury residence identification required

Reports from Town Manager

- Shared condolences to the Shahani family; thanked first responders for their difficult work and their expert training

Reports from Select Board

Vice-Chair Kouchakdjian

- Expressed her condolences and thanked public safety officials for all they do every day; thoughts with the public safety officers/responders who were impacted by the fire and rescue
- Recent reporting of home break ins; recommended that all listen to Police recommendations

Board Member Carty

- Echoed condolences to the Shahani family, and thanked all Town officials who were involved in the tragic event
- Extended good luck to LSRHS sports team members in the final tournaments, including LSRHS girls' hockey (#3 in Division 1)

- Catch Connection transport service may start as early as July 1, 2024

Board Member Russo

- Echoed his condolences to the Shahani family for their loss; thanked first responders for their efforts and who take personal risk everyday
- Echoed Vice-Chair Kouchakdjian's safety recommendations regarding recent home and auto break ins
- He also recommended residents consider maintenance of gutters, down spouts, street storm drains clearing and other maintenance tasks which are important

Board Member Roberts

Board Member Roberts announced her presence, and:

- Echoed condolences to the family on Goodman's Hill Road and the loss of the loved one due to the tragic fire – stressed the community is here to support the family, and prayers for healing of public safety officials who were affected physically and mentally
- Attended the well-done, informative documentary "Trigger: The Ripple Effect of Gun Violence," sponsored by the Presbyterian Church in conjunction with the League of Women Voters on the topic of gun violence and prevention.

Public comments

Katina Fontes, Chair of the Goodnow Library Board of Trustees inquired about the Town Meeting article concerning electric car charging stations at the Goodnow Library. She indicated the article should have come before the Select Board for inclusion on the Town Meeting Warrant.

Resident Jack Ryan, 155 Ford Road, stressed that he had been a trial attorney for years and mentioned that some Select Board Members might be forgetting residents' rights to public discourse and that freedom of speech can take many forms. He stated that First Amendment rights cannot be stunted by this Board.

Resident Manish Sharma, 77 Colonial Road, expressed his condolences for those involved in the recent home fire, as well as Sudbury safety officials. He asked for Town Manager approval to place a memorial lamp at Town Hall.

Resident Kay Bell, 348 Old Lancaster Road, requested that the Citizens Petition Article not be placed on the Consent Calendar at Town Meeting.

Resident Len Simon, 44 Meadowbrook Circle, agreed with comments made by Jack Ryan and emphasized that residents must be given the opportunity to voice their opinions. He indicated that residents have been excluded from the proposed firearms article. Mr. Simon stated there have been multiple requests to discuss the topic.

Eva Rockwell, 437 Coldbrook Drive, spoke about the war in Israel and hoped the Board would take a position regarding ceasefire, stressing that "we don't need any more Americans dying and we must protect interests at home.

Molly Conger, 36 Country Village Lane, explained that AWG is a non-profit organization for people to get antivirals for HV and herpes patients. She stated that reports show an increase in such serous viruses due to increase in immigration which could infect the population.

Michael Whitmann, 105 Hudson Road, opined about stopping migrant entry into US and stated that importing is not the cure for our problems and US does need more problems.

Bill Shaner, 36 Country Village Line, mentioned Black History month and stated that Martin Luther King Jr. should not be put on pedestal and documents have become available via FBI, proving that King was an adultery and womanizer. He urged the Board to discontinue such praise.

Chair Dretler ended the Public Comment segment, adding that the last four comments presented were not verified as being brought forth by Sudbury residents.

Consent Calendar

#1 - Vote to sign Annual Town Election Warrant for March 25, 2024, which must be posted and delivered to residents by March 18, 2024

#2 - Vote to accept the resignations of Andrea Meggison, Nalini Luthra, and Nadja Lamaute, effective immediately, from the Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Commission (DEIC) and send a letter of thanks for their service to the Town.

#3 - Vote to reappoint Historic Districts Commission (HDC) member Anuraj Shah for a term expiring 1/1/29.

#4 - Vote to accept donation of two granite benches from the Thursday Garden Club to be installed in Town Center at the WWI Memorial garden and the Blue Star memorial at Grinnell Park.

#5 - Vote to accept grant from the Executive Office of Public Safety/Department of Fire Service in the amount of \$10,300.66, as requested by Fire Chief John Whalen.

#6 - Vote to approve award of a two-year contract with Dr. Megan Betts by the Town Manager as a sole source procurement for Medical Director Services for the Fire Department's Advanced Life Support Program in the amount of \$5,000 per year, as requested by Fire Chief John Whalen.

#7 - Vote to Grant a Special Permit to the National Brain Tumor Society, to hold the "National Brain Tumor Society Ride" on Sunday, May 19, 2024, from 9:00 A.M. through approximately 1:00 P.M., subject to compliance with conditions outlined by the Police and Fire Departments, DPW and Park and Recreation, subject to receipt of a certificate of liability.

#8 - Vote to authorize the Town Manager to execute the contract for the Hosmer House Historic Structure and Cultural Landscape Report with Architectural Preservation Studio, DPC.

Board Member Carty asked that Items 1, 2 and 8 be further discussed.

Vice-Chair Kouchakdjian motioned to approve Consent Calendar Items 3, 4, 5, 6 and 7, as listed on the agenda. Board Member Russo seconded the motion.

It was on motion 5-0; Kouchakdjian-aye, Carty-aye, Roberts-aye, Russo-aye, Dretler-aye

VOTED: to approve Consent Calendar Items 3, 4, 5, 6 and 7, as listed on the agenda

As the Licensing Authority for the Town of Sudbury, in accordance with MGL c138, s. 12, vote to approve a Change of Manager for TFD II, LLC d/b/a The Farmer's Daughter Sudbury, 534 Boston Post Road, Suite 201 from Patrick Kennedy to Chandra Gouldrup and a Pledge of License, as requested in an application dated January 18, 2024.

Present: Chandra Gouldrup – The Farmer’s Daughter Sudbury

Vice-Chair Kouchakdjian motioned to approve a Change of Manager for TFD II, LLC d/b/a The Farmer's Daughter Sudbury, 534 Boston Post Road, Suite 201, from Patrick Kennedy to Chandra Gouldrup and a Pledge of License, as requested in an application dated January 18, 2024. Board Member Carty seconded the motion.

It was on motion 5-0; Kouchakdjian-aye, Carty-aye, Roberts-aye, Russo-aye, Dretler-aye

VOTED: As the Licensing Authority for the Town of Sudbury, in accordance with MGL c138, s. 12, vote to approve a Change of Manager for TFD II, LLC d/b/a The Farmer's Daughter Sudbury, 534 Boston Post Road, Suite 201 from Patrick Kennedy to Chandra Gouldrup and a Pledge of License, as requested in an application dated January 18, 2024

Discussion and update on Goal 6: Advance design and construction of Phase 3A-CSX/Rt 20 of the Bruce Freeman Rail Trail; review letter of support for inclusion on the Transportation Improvement Program (TIP).

Present: Planning and Community Development Assistant Marcia Rasmussen

Ms. Rasmussen stated that consultants Fuss & O’Neill would likely finalize the 25% Design Plan in several months as the plan must be submitted by the end of June 2024 to receive proposed grant. She confirmed that the Town submitted such grant application on February 16, 2024; she acknowledged the Planning Department is striving to meet various deadlines, and the review letter of support for inclusion on the Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) would help towards that goal.

Ms. Rasmussen explained that Phase 3A involves the 200 feet into Framingham, which finishes the Sudbury section of the BFRT. She added that Town Counsel is preparing the Memorandum of Understanding.

Ms. Rasmussen confirmed that CPC has voted to support the final \$600,000 for Phase 3 and is requesting \$500,000 in other funding.

Board Members thanked Ms. Rasmussen for her contribution to the advancement of the BFRT.

Vice-Chair Kouchakdjian motioned that the Board approve the letter of support to the Boston Metropolitan Organization for inclusion on the Transportation Improvement Program (TIP). Board Member Carty seconded the motion.

It was on motion 5-0; Kouchakdjian-aye, Carty-aye, Roberts-aye, Russo-aye, Dretler-aye

VOTED: The Board approve the letter of support to the Boston Metropolitan organization regarding for inclusion on the Transportation Improvement Program (TIP)

Board Member Roberts left the meeting at 7:56 P.M.

Discussion of Town Meeting Warrant Article submission process

Present: Combined Facilities Director Sandra Duran

Board Member Carty inquired about inclusion of the missing Warrant Article – the Goodnow Trustees charging station. Town Manager Sheehan stated that the funding for such article could come from a grant or from the Town solar agreement.

Vice-Chair Kouchakdjian agreed with Board Member Carty about the article submission process being consistent.

Board Member Carty recommended that the charging station article be included on the Town Meeting Warrant.

Board Members discussed related topics.

Board Member Roberts rejoined the meeting at 8:15 P.M.

Town Manager Sheehan offered to consult with Town Counsel about the matter.

Board Member Roberts asked Ms. Duran about the estimate associated with the proposed article. Ms. Duran indicated that she could not verify the \$80,000 estimate.

Chair Dretler asked Ms. Duran if she would join in continued review of the proposed article at the next Select Board meeting to help the Board determine the viability of the article for inclusion on the Town Meeting Warrant. Ms. Duran agreed to participate at the next Select Board meeting.

Discussion regarding 2024 Annual Town Meeting: consent calendar, positions on articles; other

Board Member Russo mentioned the importance of Warrant Articles 31 and 33, and suggested it might be wise to not present them at the same night of Town Meeting. Chair Dretler expressed her uncertainty about moving the order of the articles.

Discussion took place regarding moving Article 33 closer to Article 16.

Ms. Bell stressed the importance of keeping the Petition Article – Amend General Bylaws, Chapter 20, by Adding “Disability,” off of the Consent Calendar.

Board Member Carty commented that Consent Calendar was modified due to Covid, and hoped to see a decrease in Consent Calendar Articles to allow for added public discussion, particularly with CPC Articles. Board Member Russo mentioned that most residents were pleased to see shorter Town Meetings, and the Consent Calendar helped that happen. Vice-Chair Kouchakdjian indicated that many Town Meeting participants appreciated the Consent Calendar option in consideration of Town Meeting efficiencies and stated she had no problem leaving various articles on the Consent Calendar.

Board Member Russo supported increasing the number of articles on the Consent Calendar. Chair Dretler suggested putting Capital Article items 17, 18, 20, 21 on the Consent Calendar, and asked Members to take a straw poll for inclusion of those mentioned articles on the Consent Calendar; Kouchakdjian-aye, Carty-aye, Russo-aye, Roberts-aye, Dretler-aye.

Another Board Member Straw poll was taken to include Articles 23 through 26 on the Consent Calendar: Carty-no, Kouchakdjian-aye, Russo-aye, Roberts-aye, Dretler-aye.

Discussion and possible vote on Firearms Safety Business Use Bylaw public forum, including potential dates, time, venue, agenda, and related matters

Select Board Members discussed possible dates for the scheduling of the Firearms Safety Business Use Bylaw Public Forum.

Robust discussion regarding the Forum process and content took place.

Vice-Chair Kouchakdjian suggested that a draft Forum agenda be presented to the Board at an upcoming meeting.

Select Board Members agreed to schedule the Forum on March 28, 2024 at the Goodnow Library via hybrid Zoom communication mode.

Discussion and vote on ARPA funding and request from Fire Chief John Whalen to reallocate \$50,000

Town Manager Sheehan reviewed the ARPA PowerPoint presentation, adding that \$275,000 of ARPA funds remained. He explained that several Town departments sought to redirect funds and reallocate ARPA funds.

Vice-Chair Kouchakdjian motioned to approve the request from Fire Chief John Whalen to reallocate \$50,000 to cover costs associated with the enhancement of Fire Station #2. Board Member Russo seconded the motion.

It was on motion 5-0; Kouchakdjian-aye, Carty-aye, Roberts-aye, Russo-aye, Dretler-aye

VOTED: To approve the request from Fire Chief John Whalen to reallocate \$50,000 to cover costs associated with the enhancement of Fire Station #2

Act on request of the Sudbury Public Schools to authorize the Superintendent to submit to the Massachusetts School Building Authority Statement of Interest forms for the Nixon Elementary School and Haynes Elementary School, relative to replacement of roofs.

Present: SPS Superintendent Brad Crozier, Combined Facilities Director Sandra Duran

Mr. Crozier explained that a Select Board vote was critical and would assist with the Town obtaining MSBA funding of one-third towards accelerated repair projects.

Board Member Russo commented that in the future he would prefer to review Statement of Interest forms before voting. He thanked Mr. Crozier for seeking the additional project funding.

Vice-Chair Kouchakdjian motioned to submit to the Massachusetts School Building Authority statement of interest forms for the Nixon Elementary School and Haynes Elementary School, relative to replacement of roofs. Board Member Carty seconded the motion.

It was on motion 5-0; Kouchakdjian-aye, Carty-aye, Roberts-aye, Russo-aye, Dretler-aye

VOTED: To submit to the Massachusetts School Building Authority statement of interest forms for the Nixon Elementary School and Haynes Elementary School, relative to replacement of roofs

Vice-Chair Kouchakdjian motioned that Vote #1 Resolved: Having convened in an open meeting on February 27, 2024, prior to the SOI submission closing date, the Select Board of Sudbury, in accordance with its charter, by-laws, and ordinances, has voted to authorize the Superintendent to submit to the Massachusetts School Building Authority the Statement of Interest Form dated March 1, 2024, for the General John Nixon located at 472 Concord Rd. in Sudbury which describes and explains the following deficiencies and the priority category(s) for which an application may be submitted to the Massachusetts School Building Authority in the future: Category 5. Replacement of school facility systems, specifically the roofs, due to poor condition and age.; and hereby further specifically acknowledges that by submitting this Statement of Interest Form, the Massachusetts School Building Authority in no way guarantees the acceptance or the approval of an application, the awarding of a grant or any other funding commitment from the Massachusetts School Building Authority, or commits the Sudbury Public Schools to filing an application for funding with the Massachusetts School Building Authority. Board Member Carty seconded the motion.

It was on motion 5-0; Kouchakdjian-aye, Carty-aye, Roberts-aye, Russo-aye, Dretler-aye

VOTED: Vote #1 Resolved: Having convened in an open meeting on February 27, 2024, prior to the SOI submission closing date, the Select Board of Sudbury, in accordance with its charter, by-laws, and ordinances, has voted to authorize the Superintendent to submit to the Massachusetts School Building Authority the Statement of Interest Form dated March 1, 2024, for the General John Nixon located at 472 Concord Rd. in Sudbury which describes and explains the following deficiencies and the priority category(s) for which an application may be submitted to the Massachusetts School Building Authority in the future: Category 5. Replacement of school facility systems, specifically the roofs, due to poor condition and age.; and hereby further specifically acknowledges that by submitting this Statement of Interest Form, the Massachusetts School Building Authority in no way guarantees the acceptance or the approval of an application, the awarding of a grant or any other funding commitment from the Massachusetts School Building Authority, or commits the Sudbury Public Schools to filing an application for funding with the Massachusetts School Building Authority

Vice-Chair Kouchakdjian motioned that Vote #2 Resolved: Having convened in an open meeting on February 27, 2024, prior to the SOI submission closing date, the Select Board of Sudbury, in accordance with its charter, by-laws, and ordinances, has voted to authorize the Superintendent to submit to the Massachusetts School Building Authority the Statement of Interest Form dated March 1, 2024, for the Josiah Haynes Elementary Schools located at 169 16 Packet Pg. 79 Haynes Rd. in Sudbury which describes and explains the following deficiencies and the priority category(s) for which an application may be submitted to the Massachusetts School Building Authority in the future: Category 5. Replacement of school facility systems, specifically the roofs, due to poor condition and age.; and hereby further specifically acknowledges that by submitting this Statement of Interest Form, the Massachusetts School Building Authority in no way guarantees the acceptance or the approval of an application, the awarding of a grant or any other funding commitment from the Massachusetts School Building Authority, or commits the Sudbury Public Schools to filing an application for funding with the Massachusetts School Building Authority. Member Carty seconded the motion.

It was on motion 5-0; Kouchakdjian-aye, Carty-aye, Roberts-aye, Russo-aye, Dretler-aye

VOTED: Vote #2 Resolved: Having convened in an open meeting on February 27, 2024, prior to the SOI submission closing date, the Select Board of Sudbury, in accordance with its charter, by-laws, and ordinances, has voted to authorize the Superintendent to submit to the Massachusetts School Building

Authority the Statement of Interest Form dated March 1, 2024, for the Josiah Haynes Elementary Schools located at 169 16 Packet Pg. 79 Haynes Rd. in Sudbury which describes and explains the following deficiencies and the priority category(s) for which an application may be submitted to the Massachusetts School Building Authority in the future: Category 5. Replacement of school facility systems, specifically the roofs, due to poor condition and age.; and hereby further specifically acknowledges that by submitting this Statement of Interest Form, the Massachusetts School Building Authority in no way guarantees the acceptance or the approval of an application, the awarding of a grant or any other funding commitment from the Massachusetts School Building Authority, or commits the Sudbury Public Schools to filing an application for funding with the Massachusetts School Building Authority.

Discussion and possible vote on Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion Commission (DEI) Status and Mission

Board Member Roberts provided update regarding the modified DEI Mission Statement, Membership and training. She added that DEI would be meeting on Thursday, February 29, 2024 to solidify the number of DEI members and plan for professional training.

Related Select Board discussion took place.

Review the Select Board Winter 2024 Newsletter articles and approve for distribution

Board Members reviewed 2024 Newsletter article as presented. Board Member Carty reported a modification to his article.

Members discussed content of articles, with particular focus on the Firearms Bylaw Town Meeting Article.

Chair Dretler read in the words of the motion. Vice-Chair Kouchakdjian moved in the words of the Chair. Board Member Carty seconded the motion.

It was on motion 5-0; Kouchakdjian-aye, Carty-aye, Russo-aye, Roberts-aye, Dretler-aye

VOTED: To approve the Select Board Winter 2024 Newsletter articles and approve for distribution, with Board Member Carty presenting an edit to his article.

Vote to review and possibly approve the open session minutes of 1/9/24

Vice-Chair Kouchakdjian motioned to approve the open session minutes of 1/9/24, as edited. Board Member Russo seconded the motion.

It was on motion 5-0; Kouchakdjian-aye, Carty-aye, Russo-aye, Roberts-aye, Dretler-aye

VOTED: To approve the open session minutes of 1/9/24, as edited

Consent Calendar Items #1, #2 and #8

Board Members discussed aspects of Consent Calendar items #1 and #2.

Vice-Chair Kouchakdjian motioned to approve Consent Calendar items #1 and #2. Board Member Russo seconded the motion.

It was on motion 5-0; Kouchakdjian-aye, Carty-aye, Russo-aye, Roberts-aye, Dretler-aye

VOTED: To approve Consent Calendar items #1 and #2

Consent Calendar #8

Board Member Russo suggested that the topic might require a more dedicated Historical Commission focus going forward, and hoped the art aspect might be addressed in the future. Town Manager Sheehan confirmed this vote reflected the overall structure, which would affect the artwork.

Vice-Chair Kouchakdjian motioned to approve Consent Calendar item #8. Board Member Russo seconded the motion.

It was on motion 5-0; Kouchakdjian-aye, Carty-aye, Russo-aye, Roberts-aye, Dretler-aye

VOTED: To approve Consent Calendar item #8

Vice-Chair Kouchakdjian motioned to adjourn the Select Board Meeting. Board Member Russo seconded the motion.

It was on motion 5-0; Kouchakdjian-aye, Carty-aye, Russo-aye, Roberts-aye, Dretler-aye

VOTED: To adjourn the Select Board Meeting

There being no further business, the meeting ended at 10:37 P.M.

SB Meeting – 2/227/24 Documents & Exhibits

1. Vote to sign Annual Town Election Warrant for March 25, 2024, which must be posted and delivered to residents by March 18, 2024.

Attachments:

1.a 2024 ATE Warrant._final

2. Vote to accept the resignations of Andrea Meggison, Nalini Luthra, and Nadja Lamaute, effective immediately, from the Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Commission (DEIC) and send a letter of thanks for their service to the Town.

Attachments:

2.a DEIC resignation

2.b Resignation from DEI

2.c Resignation from DEI_Lamaute

3. Vote to reappoint Historic Districts Commission (HDC) member Anuraj Shah for a term expiring 1/1/29.

Attachments:

3.a SB Recommendation Letter - Shah 240201

5. Vote to accept grant from the Executive Office of Public Safety/Department of Fire Service in the amount of \$10,300.66, as requested by Fire Chief John Whalen.

Attachments:

5.a FY24 FFE Grant Executed Contract_Sudbury

6. Vote to approve award of a two-year contract with Dr. Megan Betts by the Town Manager as a sole source procurement for Medical Director Services for the Fire Department's Advanced Life Support Program in the amount of \$5,000 per year, as requested by Fire Chief John Whalen.

Attachments:

6.a Sudbury Medical Director Contract

7. Vote to Grant a Special Permit to the National Brain Tumor Society, to hold the "National Brain Tumor Society Ride" on Sunday, May 19, 2024, from 9:00 A.M. through approximately 1:00 P.M., subject to compliance with conditions outlined by the Police and Fire Departments, DPW and Park and Recreation, subject to receipt of a certificate of liability.

Attachments:

7.a Brain Tumor Ride 2024 Application_SB

7.b Brain Tumor Ride Feedback 2024

8. Vote to authorize the Town Manager to execute the contract for the Hosmer House Historic Structure and Cultural Landscape Report with Architectural Preservation Studio, DPC.

Attachments:

8.a Contract HH HSR CLR 1 24 2024_PJsigned

9. As the Licensing Authority for the Town of Sudbury, in accordance with MGL c138, s. 12, vote to approve a Change of Manager for TFD II, LLC d/b/a The Farmer's Daughter Sudbury, 534 Boston Post Road, Suite 201 from Patrick Kennedy to Chandra Gouldrup and a Pledge of License, as requested in an application dated January 18, 2024.

Attachments:

- 9.a TFD Multiple Amendments Application 2024_SB
- 9.b RE_Farmer's Daughter Feedback
- 9.c Department Feedback_The Farmers Daughter_2024

10. Discussion and update on Goal 6: Advance design and construction of Phase 3A-CSX/Rt 20 of the Bruce Freeman Rail Trail; review letter of support for inclusion on the Transportation Improvement Program (TIP).

Attachments:

- 10.a Letter of Support Sudbury Select Board 0221 2024

11. Discussion of Town Meeting warrant article submission process.

Attachments:

- 11.a KP-#900346-v1-ATM_Article_Form_-_EV_Chargers

12. Discussion regarding 2024 Annual Town Meeting: consent calendar, positions on articles; other.

Attachments:

- 12.a 2024 ATM_Articles_draft

14. Discussion and vote on ARPA funding and request from Fire Chief John Whalen to reallocate \$50,000.

Attachments:

- 14.a Station #2 ARPA Funds Memo
- 14.b ARPA Status Update 2024-02-23 AJS

15. Discussion and possible vote on Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion Commission (DEI) Status and Mission

Attachments:

- 15.a DEI Commission Mission Statement Amended and Approved 09.28.22

17. Review the Select Board Winter 2024 Newsletter articles and approve for distribution.

Attachments:

- 17.a Sudbury Municipal Update Newsletter Winter 2024_Select Board

18. Vote to review and possibly approve the open session minutes of 1/9/24.

Attachments:

- 18.a SB_draft1_1.09.24_min for review
- 18.b SB_draft1_1.09.24_min for review_carty_edits